

# **Report on the Project Development and Appraisal Results**

*(as of 22 April 2019)*

## **I. Introduction**

In accordance with the Second Session of the Assembly to supplement Decision 18-II-19S on Approval of Projects, the Secretariat was tasked to report and provide information on the process of submission of project concept notes and project proposals and appraisal results. In addition, the updates on the progress of approved projects including the funding situation and information on other concept notes under consideration are provided. The procedure for project development, appraisal and fund mobilization is undertaken in accordance with the Project Manual approved at the First Session of the Assembly.

## **II. Project Development and Appraisal Results of Projects Provisionally Approved at the 2<sup>nd</sup> Session of the Assembly**

Among the concept notes submitted, four (4) concept notes from Myanmar, the Philippines and the Secretariat were recommended to be developed as full project proposals.

*\* The project proposal on forest fire management in Cambodia, Laos, Myanmar and Vietnam was developed by the Secretariat for co-funding under the ASEAN-ROK Cooperation Fund (AKCF)*

Following the recommendation, four (4) project proposals were submitted by 1 April 2019, and the Secretariat conducted the project appraisal process accordingly. The Project Appraisal Panel (PAP) consisting of three (3) experts from the expert pool appointed by the Executive Director of the Secretariat was organized to review each project proposal submitted.

As the result of the first review on the project proposals by the respective PAP completed by 11 April 2019, all of the four (4) project proposals were requested to revise by incorporating the comments and recommendations of the PAP members. The project re-appraisal process for revised proposals was proceeded by the same PAP and completed on 22 April 2019, and all four (4) project proposals satisfied the evaluation criteria for the submission to the Assembly for approval. The table of appraisal results is provided in **Appendix 1** and the full project proposals are provided in the **Appendix 2**.

## **III. Other Concept Notes Under Consideration**

There are a total of 12 project concept notes submitted to the Secretariat. One (1) concept note submitted by Bhutan is under consideration by the Secretariat and Bhutan for development of project proposal. Other 11 concept notes were submitted by the Observers and formal communication will be made by the Secretariat after deposit of instrument of the AFoCO Agreement. The 12 project concept notes are listed in **Appendix 3**.

## **IV. Progress of Projects Approved at the First Session of the Assembly**

Regarding the four (4) projects approved at the First Session of the Assembly, the Secretariat has been seeking funds from potential donors. The projects are proposed to the Republic of Korea (ROK) for funding and it is undertaking internal review to make final grant awarding decisions. The Cambodia and Viet Nam projects are under final review by MOFA-ROK and the funding is expected to be confirmed soon by the Korean government. The ROK is undertaking the inter-ministry consultation for Bhutan and Timor-Leste projects as additional countries under the AFoCO programs and projects. The Secretariat will inform respective countries immediately after the project funds are confirmed.

## Appendix 1. Table of Appraisal Results

| PROJECT CODE  | Project Appraisal Panel (PAP) | 1 <sup>st</sup> Appraisal Grade | 1 <sup>st</sup> Appraisal PAP's Comments   | 1 <sup>st</sup> Appraisal Result | 2 <sup>nd</sup> Appraisal Grade | 2 <sup>nd</sup> Appraisal Result |
|---|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|--|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| <b>2019-PH-005</b><br><i>Promotion of Vertical Integration in Wood Processing</i>         | Member 1                      | B                               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Details of potential benefit sharing with local implementers should be described</li> <li>- Lack of custom of custody impact analysis on the project implementation</li> <li>- Need to consider reducing the number of project sites and increasing the project period</li> </ul>   | B                                | A                               | A                                |
|   | Member 2                      | B                               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Budget allocated to procurement such as machineries, equipment and vehicles is too much and is not in line with the objectives</li> <li>- Need to consider reducing the number of project sites</li> </ul>  |                                  | A                               |                                  |
|   | Member 3                      | B                               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- More background information and clearer objectives required</li> <li>- Considering the sustainability/duplicability of this project, the procurement of expensive machineries and vehicles is questionable and needs to be reduced</li> <li>- Need to consider reducing the number of project sites and extending the project period</li> </ul> |                                  | A                               |                                  |
| <b>2019-MM-006</b><br><i>Integrated Pest &amp; Disease Management in Teak Plantations</i> | Member 1                      | A                               | (No comments)  | B                                | A                               | A                                |
|   | Member 2                      | B                               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Detailed information on the current status in Teak forests damaged by pest/diseases should be included</li> <li>- Methodology of research is not clear, and sampling design and data analysis need to be specified</li> </ul>   |                                  | A                               |                                  |
|   | Member 3                      | B                               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- A clearer analysis of problems with evidences is needed</li> <li>- Re-organization of the design of project objectives and respective activities regarding policy development should be reconsidered</li> </ul>   |                                  | A                               |                                  |
| <b>2019-MM-007</b><br><i>Livelihood Improvement of Forest Dependent Communities</i>       | Member 1                      | B                               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Project coverage should be expanded to other regions in Asia, and project sites should not be limited to Myanmar only</li> <li>- Clear objectives and corresponding outputs, exit strategy, and benefit sharing mechanism should be specified</li> </ul>  | B                                | A                               | A                                |
|   | Member 2                      | A                               | (No comments)  |                                  | A                               |                                  |
|   | Member 3                      | B                               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- In line with the project marketing aspect of the project, more information on the current status of the local communities in the project sites is required</li> <li>- Cost estimates for the project, including staff honorarium, should be justified</li> </ul>  |                                  | A                               |                                  |
| <b>2019-MC-008</b><br><i>Capacity Building on Enhancing Resilience to Forest Fire</i>     | Member 1                      | A                               | (No comments)  | B                                | A                               | A                                |
|   | Member 2                      | B                               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- A more in-depth analysis of the selected landscapes and stakeholders is needed to understand the causes of fire in that region</li> <li>- More information on each of the pilot sites is required</li> </ul>  |                                  | A                               |                                  |
|   | Member 3                      | B                               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Problem tree needs to be improved and stronger justification for slash and burn farming as the main cause of forest fires should be provided</li> <li>- More elaboration on the sustainability of the project after its completion is required</li> </ul>   |                                  | A                               |                                  |

### Appendix 3. Status of Concept Notes under Consideration as of 22 April 2019

|    | Reg. No.    | Country | Project Title  | Current Status   |
|----|-------------|---------|--|--|
| 1  | 2018-BH-001 | BH      | Development of Reforestation and Afforestation Model in Bhutan   | Concept note was submitted and requested to revise by the Secretariat (Ref.No.: DE-6 as of 17 Jan. 2019)         |
| 2  | 2018-ID-001 | ID      | Forest Landscape Restoration (FLR): Mobilizing Existing Resources for Rural Livelihoods in Drylands  | Concept note was submitted on 16 April 2018 and formal communication will be made after deposit of instrument    |
| 3  | 2018-ID-002 | ID      | Enhancing capacity and capability of the Forest Area for Special Purposes (FASP) Management for research and education                               | Concept note was submitted on 15 October 2018 and formal communication will be made after deposit of instrument  |
| 4  | 2019-ID-003 | ID      | Promoting Community Entrepreneurship Capacity For Improving Local Livelihood In Managing Forest For Prosperity                                       | Concept note was submitted on 15 April 2019 and formal communication will be made after deposit of instrument    |
| 5  | 2019-ID-004 | ID      | Community-based forest related-landslide and flash flood mitigations through application of slope stabilization techniques                           | Concept note was submitted on 15 April 2019 and formal communication will be made after deposit of instrument    |
| 6  | 2018-KZ-001 | KZ      | Phyto forest melioration of the dried bottom of the Aral Sea   | Concept note was submitted on 9 February 2018 and formal communication will be made after deposit of instrument  |
| 7  | 2018-KZ-002 | KZ      | Inventory of uncounted forestlands of the Republic of Kazakhstan with the further preparation of materials for its transfer to the State Forest Fund | Concept note was submitted on 9 February 2018 and formal communication will be made after deposit of instrument  |
| 8  | 2018-KZ-003 | KZ      | Duplication of the Forest Fire Management Information System in an area of 3 million ha.   | Concept note was submitted on 9 February 2018 and formal communication will be made after deposit of instrument  |
| 9  | 2018-KZ-004 | KZ      | Creation of bank of forest seeds and genetic bank of flora in the Republic of Kazakhstan   | Concept note was submitted on 9 February 2018 and formal communication will be made after deposit of instrument  |
| 10 | 2018-KZ-005 | KZ      | Creating biological laboratory breeding entomophagy  | Concept note was submitted on 9 February 2018 and formal communication will be made after deposit of instrument  |
| 11 | 2018-TH-001 | TH      | Ecotourism Center Project 'Pong Pu Phueng Hot Spring'  | Concept note was submitted on 27 November 2017 and formal communication will be made after deposit of instrument |
| 12 | 2018-TH-002 | TH      | Tree Planting for Rural Livelihood Improvement   | Concept note was submitted on 27 November 2017 and formal communication will be made after deposit of instrument |